

**NEW YORK COURT OF APPEALS**

*CJA, et al. v. Joint Commission on Public Ethics, et al.*  
APL 2024-00150

**Appeal of Right, pursuant to Article VI, §3(b)(1) of the NYS Constitution  
& CPLR §5601(b)(1)**

**AFFIRMATION OF SERVICE**

ELENA RUTH SASSOWER, affirms the following to be true under penalties of perjury, pursuant to CPLR §2106:

On the 4<sup>th</sup> day of December 2024, I served Respondents, by their attorney, Respondent Attorney General Letitia James, with Appellants' December 3, 2024 letter to Clerk Davis, by e-mail. The transmitting e-mail to Assistant Solicitor General Beezly Kiernan, reflecting consented-to service by both sides, is attached.



Elena Ruth Sassower, unrepresented appellant-petitioner, individually and as Director of the Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc, acting on her own behalf and on behalf of the People of the State of New York & the Public Interest

Dated: White Plains, New York  
December 4, 2024

**Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA)**

---

**From:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <elena@judgewatch.org>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 4, 2024 3:08 PM  
**To:** 'Kiernan, Beezly'  
**Subject:** Thank you --Service of Appellants' Uploaded Dec 3 Responses to Ct of Appeals Nov 4 Jurisdictional Inquiry Letters: CJA v. JCOPE, et al (APL-2024-00150); CJA v. Commission...Wilson, Zayas, et al (APL-2024-00149)  
**Attachments:** MatterofCenterforJudicialAccountability-app-Sassower-JurRsp.pdf; MatterofCenterforJudicialAccountability-appSassower-JurRsp.pdf

**TO: Assistant Solicitor General Kiernan**

I will furnish this e-mail chain to the Court with my mailed letters as proof of service by both sides for both appeals.

Thank you.

Elena Sassower  
-----

---

**From:** Kiernan, Beezly <Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 4, 2024 3:03 PM  
**To:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <elena@judgewatch.org>  
**Subject:** RE: Appellants' Uploaded Dec 3 Responses to Ct of Appeals Nov 4 Jurisdictional Inquiry Letters: CJA v. JCOPE, et al (APL-2024-00150); CJA v. Commission...Wilson, Zayas, et al (APL-2024-00149)

Ms. Sassower,

Yes, you may serve me by email. I mailed out hard copies of our letters; PDF copies are attached.

**Beezly J. Kiernan | Assistant Solicitor General**  
Office of the New York State Attorney General  
Division of Appeals & Opinions  
The Capitol  
Albany, NY 12224-0341  
(518) 776-2023  
-----

---

**From:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <elena@judgewatch.org>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 4, 2024 2:44 PM  
**To:** Kiernan, Beezly <Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov>  
**Subject:** Appellants' Uploaded Dec 3 Responses to Ct of Appeals Nov 4 Jurisdictional Inquiry Letters: CJA v. JCOPE, et al (APL-2024-00150); CJA v. Commission...Wilson, Zayas, et al (APL-2024-00149)

**TO: Assistant Solicitor General Kiernan**

Do I understand correctly from your below October 30<sup>th</sup> e-mail to me that I may serve you by e-mail with appellants' submissions to the Court of Appeals in *CJA v. JCOPE, et al* (APL-2024-00150) and *CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation... Wilson, Zayas, et al* (APL-2024-00149).

If yes, I will e-mail you the two letters I uploaded to the Court of Appeals' portal yesterday night – and which I will be hard-mailing later today.

I will, in turn, accept service from you, by e-mail. In any event, kindly attach your own letters to your response.

Thank you.

Elena Sassower, unrepresented individual petitioner-appellant,  
acting on her own behalf and on behalf of the People of the State of New York & the Public Interest

---

**From:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <[elena@judgewatch.org](mailto:elena@judgewatch.org)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 19, 2024 11:06 AM  
**To:** 'Kiernan, Beezly' <[Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov)>

**Subject:** Thank you, ASG Kiernan -- RE: CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation, et al (APL-2024-00149 ): Extension to Dec 4 for Jurisdictional Inquiry. Also, CJA v. JCOPE (APL-2024-00150).

For your indicated cc to me, no need to snail-mail me the letter. Attaching it to an e-mail will suffice.

Thank you.

Elena Sassower

---

**From:** Kiernan, Beezly <[Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 19, 2024 10:14 AM  
**To:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <[elena@judgewatch.org](mailto:elena@judgewatch.org)>

**Subject:** RE: CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation, et al (APL-2024-00149 ): Extension to Dec 4 for Jurisdictional Inquiry. Also, CJA v. JCOPE (APL-2024-00150).

Thank you, Ms. Sassower. Yes, I am also handling APL-2024-00150, and I have also requested an extension in that case to December 4, 2024. We will send a letter confirming that extension to the Court and to you.

**Beezly J. Kiernan | Assistant Solicitor General**  
Office of the New York State Attorney General  
Division of Appeals & Opinions  
The Capitol  
Albany, NY 12224-0341  
(518) 776-2023

---

**From:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <[elena@judgewatch.org](mailto:elena@judgewatch.org)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 19, 2024 10:10 AM  
**To:** Kiernan, Beezly <[Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov)>

**Subject: CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation, et al (APL-2024-00149): Extension to Dec 4 for Jurisdictional Inquiry. Also, CJA v. JCOPE (APL-2024-00150).**

**TO: Assistant Solicitor General Kiernan**

This is to advise that you have until December 4, 2024 to respond to [Court of Appeals Deputy Clerk Davis' November 6, 2024 jurisdictional inquiry letter \(APL-2024-00149\)](#) pertaining to [CJA's October 21, 2024 notice of appeal and preliminary appeal statement in CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation, et al.](#), as I have requested and obtained an extension to that date.

Also, are you also handling *CJA v. JCOPE, et al.* at the Court of Appeals? **Please let me know**, as there, too, you have until December 4, 2024 to respond to Deputy [Clerk Davis' November 6, 2024 jurisdictional inquiry letter \(APL-2024-00150\)](#) pertaining to [CJA's October 21, 2024 notice of appeal and preliminary appeal statement](#), as I have likewise requested and obtained an extension to that date.

Thank you.

Elena Sassower, unrepresented individual petitioner-appellant,  
acting on her own behalf and on behalf of the People of the State of New York & the Public Interest

---

**From:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <[elena@judgewatch.org](mailto:elena@judgewatch.org)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 30, 2024 3:08 PM  
**To:** 'Kiernan, Beezly' <[Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov)>  
**Cc:** 'Engelhart, Noah' <[Noah.Engelhart@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Noah.Engelhart@ag.ny.gov)>; 'Moore, John' <[John.Moore@ag.ny.gov](mailto:John.Moore@ag.ny.gov)>

**Subject: Thank you, ASG Kiernan -- RE: CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation, et al -- October 21, 2024 Notice of Appeal to the Court of Appeals & Preliminary Appeal Statement**

**TO: Assistant Solicitor General Kiernan**

Thank you for your below e-mail, which I have just seen, after responding to AAG Moore's October 25<sup>th</sup> e-mail to me, which is above-attached.

I will apprise the Court.

Thank you.

Elena Sassower

---

**From:** Kiernan, Beezly <[Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Beezly.Kiernan@ag.ny.gov)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 30, 2024 10:22 AM  
**To:** [elena@judgewatch.org](mailto:elena@judgewatch.org)  
**Cc:** Engelhart, Noah <[Noah.Engelhart@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Noah.Engelhart@ag.ny.gov)>

**Subject: RE: CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation, et al -- October 21, 2024 Notice of Appeal to the Court of Appeals & Preliminary Appeal Statement**

Ms. Sassower,

I will be handling this appeal in the Court of Appeals. I accept service by email.

Thank you,

**Beezly J. Kiernan | Assistant Solicitor General**  
Office of the New York State Attorney General  
Division of Appeals & Opinions  
The Capitol  
Albany, NY 12224-0341  
(518) 776-2023

---

**From:** Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. (CJA) <[elena@judgewatch.org](mailto:elena@judgewatch.org)>

**Sent:** Friday, October 25, 2024 10:49 AM

**To:** Engelhart, Noah <[Noah.Engelhart@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Noah.Engelhart@ag.ny.gov)>

**Subject:** CJA v. Commission on Legislative, Judicial & Executive Compensation, et al -- October 21, 2024 Notice of Appeal to the Court of Appeals & Preliminary Appeal Statement

**TO: Assistant Attorney General Noah Engelhart --**

On Monday, October 21<sup>st</sup>, I uploaded to the Supreme Court docket ([Albany Co. Index #902654-24](#)) petitioners' Notice of Appeal to the Court of Appeals with Preliminary Appeal Statement – [NYSCEF #95](#).

I must send an original and a copy to the Court of Appeals with an affidavit of service. The Court of Appeals has advised that I can serve you, by e-mail, if you consent to same.

Please let me know whether you will deem the above-attached Notice of Appeal with Preliminary Appeal Statement (NYSCEF #95) as service, or require that I mail you a hard copy, which I will expeditiously do.

Thank you.

Elena Sassower, unrepresented individual petitioner-appellant,  
acting on her own behalf and on behalf of the People of the State of New York & the Public Interest

**IMPORTANT NOTICE:** This e-mail, including any attachments, may be confidential, privileged or otherwise legally protected. It is intended only for the addressee. If you received this e-mail in error or from someone who was not authorized to send it to you, do not disseminate, copy or otherwise use this e-mail or its attachments. Please notify the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete the e-mail from your system.