

# New York Law Journal

Serving the Bench and Bar Since 1888



Official Publication for the First  
And Second Judicial Departments

150 East 42nd Street, Mezzanine Level, New York, N.Y. 10017

Hank Grezlak,  
Editor-in-Chief, Regional Brands & Legal Themes

Joe Pavone,  
Senior Director of Sales - West, Marketing Solutions

Carlos Curbelo,  
Director of Marketing Solutions, ALM East

Donald Chalphin,  
National Sales Director ALM Events & Sponsorships

Susan DeSantis,  
Deputy Editor-in-Chief

Angela Turturro,  
Sections Editor

#### Reporters:

Dan M. Clark, Jason Grant,  
Tom McParland, Jack Newsham

#### Art Department:

Monika Kozak, Rafal Pytel,  
David Handschuh, photographer

#### Decisions:

Larisa Blinderman, William Thiess

#### Calendars:

Patricia Kane, editor

#### Production:

Steve Warren, Michelle Grutman,  
Agnieszka Czuj

#### Web:

Lora Hollien

#### BOARD OF EDITORS

Matthew Biben, Sheila Birnbaum,

Sheila Boston, Mary Eaton,

Robert Giuffra, Taa Grays,

Caitlin Halligan, Ruth S. Hochberger,

Patricia M. Hynes, Roberta Kaplan,

Victor A. Kovner, Judith Livingston,

Scott E. Mollen, Carolyn Nussbaum,

Thomas Oliva, David Schulz,

Alan Vinegrad, Dwight Yoo,

Mark C. Zauderer, Peter L. Zimroth

#### EDITORS EMERITUS

Floyd Abrams, H. Rodgin Cohen,

Robert B. Fiske Jr.,

Charles G. Moerdler,

Herbert Rubin



#### ALM:

212-457-9400; 800-888-8300

New York City Newsroom: 212-457-7958

Advertising: 212-457-9465

Legal Notices: 866-305-3058

#### ALM SENIOR MANAGEMENT

Bill Carter, President, Chief Executive Officer

Molly Miller, Chief Content Officer

Mark Fried, Chief Financial Officer And President/Events

Allan Milloy, Chief Sales Officer, Paid Content

Matthew Weiner, Chief Sales Officer, Marketing Solutions

Erika Maurice, Associate General Counsel

Erin Dziekan, Vice President, Human Resources

Jeff Fried, Vice President/Public Notice Operations



#### READER'S SERVICES

For subscriptions and to purchase  
back issues, call 1-877-256-2472.

For questions regarding reprints  
and permissions, call 1-877-257-3382,  
e-mail [reprints@alm.com](mailto:reprints@alm.com),  
or visit [almreprints.com](http://almreprints.com).

To track calendar and motion information  
for individual cases, call MA 3000  
at 212-457-4988.

Send decisions of interest to  
[decisions@alm.com](mailto:decisions@alm.com)

To access decisions and articles published  
in the Law Journal, visit [nylj.com](http://nylj.com).

## Letters to the Editor

### A Call for Scholarship, Civic Engagement & Amicus Curiae Before the NYCOA

New York—the “Excelsior State”—has 13 law schools, a 70,000-plus-member state bar association, countless county, city and specialized bar associations, a vast array of universities, colleges and other schools with scholars of constitutional law and political science, as well as think tanks and research institutes. Yet, it was solo practitioner Roger Bennet Adler who sounded the alarm by his recent perspective column entitled “It’s Legally Perilous to Have a Commission Responsible for Election Laws” whose internet subtitle (8/9/19) and stand-out text in its print edition (8/13/19) was even more stark, reading: “Simply put, there are no available legislative shortcuts around the State Constitution. The recent attempts to ignore it to raise legislative and executive salaries via an appointed commission is in clear violation.”

Where are the voices of the scholars of the New York state constitution and other experts of law and political science about the “clear violation” that has been going on in statutorily delegating legislative powers to commissions? The most cursory

investigation would reveal it to be even more flagrantly unconstitutional than what Mr. Adler so admirably describes.

I should know. For more than seven years, I have been single-handedly litigating its unconstitutionality and unlawfulness, as written, as applied and by its enactment in three major lawsuits, brought expressly “on behalf of the People of the State of New York & the Public Interest.” The third of these lawsuits, encompassing the prior two, is now before the New York Court of Appeals, appealing by right and by leave the Appellate Division, Third Department’s December 27, 2018 decision in *Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc. v. Cuomo*, 167 A.D.3d 1406.

This is the decision Mr. Adler identifies and describes as being one of three decisions cited by Albany Supreme Court Justice Ryba in her June 7, 2019 decision upholding the constitutionality of the statutory delegation of legislative power challenged in *Delgado v. State of New York*. In fact, *CJA v. Cuomo* is the first decision to which Justice Ryba cites—and eight times in total—because it is the decision on which she relies, involving, as it does, a materially identical statute. As for Mr. Adler’s description that the *CJA v. Cuomo* decision “upheld the delegation to the commission to increasing judicial salaries”—implying that it did not uphold delegation of legislative and

executive salaries, this is incorrect. It upheld these, as well.

The shocking record of *CJA v. Cuomo*—including before the Court of Appeals—is accessible from the Center for Judicial Accountability’s website and powerfully refutes Mr. Adler’s assertion that “legislating by proxy commissioners, is doomed to failure when judicially challenged.”

Likewise, his further comment that a newly-commenced lawsuit challenging the constitutionality of the Public Campaign Finance and Election Commission “is an initial salvo in a legal struggle to vindicate the plain words of the State Constitution, and hold the Legislature constitutionally accountable.”

I invite Mr. Adler to join with me in rallying scholars, experts and just plain civic-minded attorneys to examine and report on the record and to file amicus curiae briefs with the Court of Appeals. Especially is this important because *CJA v. Cuomo* is dispositive of *Delgado* and of the five current other lawsuits challenging delegations of legislative power to commissions/committees—a fact I stated to the Court of Appeals, most recently by an August 9, 2019 letter—without contest from the Attorney General.

**Elena Sassower**  
is the director of the Center  
for Judicial Accountability.

## An ALM Publication

The New York Law Journal  
(ISSN 0028-7326) (USPS 383020)  
is published daily except Saturdays, Sundays

Designated by the New York Court of Appeals  
pursuant to Article VI, Section 28(b)  
of the State Constitution.

Designated by the Appellate Divisions,  
First and Second Departments,  
to publish notices referred on them

of New York as a newspaper of general  
circulation for the publication of legal notices  
in civil and admiralty causes.

Postmaster: Send address changes to the  
New York Law Journal, 150 East 42nd Street,  
Mezzanine Level, New York, N.Y. 10017. Available

## COMMENTARY

### Law Firm Margins Tighten