

TABLE OF CONTENTS: RECORD ON APPEAL

Plaintiffs’ Statement Pursuant to CPLR §5531xx

Plaintiffs’ January 10, 2018 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement and accompanying “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge Denise Hartman’s November 28, 2017 Decision and Judgment1

JUDGE HARTMAN’s NOVEMBER 28, 2017 DECISION AND JUDGMENT31

Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement42

JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER.....49

JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 AMENDED DECISION AND ORDER.....52

Plaintiffs’ August 5, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement61

JUDGE HARTMAN’s JUNE 26, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER.....68

* * *

Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Order to Show Cause with Stay & TRO, as signed by Judge Roger McDonough on September 2, 201680

Plaintiff Sassower’s September 2, 2016 Moving Affidavit.....83

Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Summons & Verified Complaint.....85

Exhibit A: Plaintiffs’ March 23, 2016 Verified Second Supplemental Complaint in prior citizen-taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo* (Albany Co. #1788-2014)135

Exhibit B: Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in prior citizen-taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo* (Albany Co. #1788-2014)226

Exhibit C: Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 Verified Supplemental Complaint in prior citizen-taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo* (Albany Co. #1788-2014)273

Exhibit D: Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order.....315

<u>Exhibit E:</u>	Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision and Order	326
<u>Exhibit F:</u>	Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision and Order	335
<u>Exhibit G:</u>	Plaintiffs’ analysis of Justice McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order.....	338
<u>Exhibit H:</u>	Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d; pp. 1-2, 72-73, 94, 96-97, 100, 124-125	374
<u>Exhibit I-1:</u>	Plaintiffs’ July 13, 2016 FOIL request: “State Aid to the Counties for District Attorney Salaries for Calendar Years 2010-2016”	384
<u>Exhibit I-2:</u>	July 20, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer	386
<u>Exhibit I-3:</u>	July 22, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer	387
<u>Exhibit J-1:</u>	Plaintiffs’ July 11, 2016 FOIL request: ‘The ‘plan’ to reimburse counties not covered by Judiciary Law §183-a for district attorney salaries: fiscal years 2016-17, 2015-16, and 2014-15”	388
<u>Exhibit J-2:</u>	July 15, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services’ records access officer	389
<u>Exhibit J-3:</u>	August 12, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services’ records access officer	390
<u>Exhibit J-4:</u>	July 25, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer	391
<u>Exhibit K:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 1, 2016 FOIL request: “Director of the Budget’s certificate of approval of the Division of Criminal Justice Services’ budget for fiscal year 2016-2017, contained in Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d – & any certification by the Division of Criminal Justice Services of its own budget”	392
<u>Transcript of September 2, 2016 Oral Argument</u>		444
<u>Plaintiffs’ September 7, 2016 Notice to New York State’s 62 Counties & to their institutional/lobbying entities of their Right to Seek Intervention, pursuant to CPLR §1012 and §1013, with affidavit of service and e-mail transmittal receipts</u>		393

<u>Exhibit Q-3:</u>	September 9, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer.....	465
<u>Exhibit Q-4:</u>	September 12, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer	466
<u>Exhibit R:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 7, 2016 e-mail to the 62 counties of the State of New York, plus their institutional/lobbying entities	398
	Plaintiff attached September 7, 2016 Notice of Right to Intervene.....	393
<u>Exhibit S:</u>	Plaintiff Sassower’s September 8, 2016 affidavit of service for plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint, Order to Show Cause, & Moving Affidavit	467
	<u>Plaintiffs’ September 30, 2016 Reply/Opposition Memorandum of Law</u>	471
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s DECEMBER 21, 2016 DECISION AND ORDER</u>	527
	<u>Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin</u>	548
	<u>Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017</u>	536
	<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u>	538
<u>Exhibit T-1:</u>	Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	527
<u>Exhibit T-2:</u>	AAG Kerwin’s February 3, 2017 Notice of Entry.....	545
<u>Exhibit T-3:</u>	Plaintiff Sassower’s January 17, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	546
<u>Exhibit T-4:</u>	Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer to plaintiffs’ Verified Complaint, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin	548
<u>Exhibit U:</u>	Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order	554
<u>Exhibit V:</u>	Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	578

<u>Exhibit W:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 23, 2016 FOIL/records request to Secretary of Senate & Governor’s Records Access Officer – “RE: Nomination & Confirmation of Denise Hartman to the New York Court of Claims”	579
<u>Exhibit W-1:</u>	Secretary of the Senate’s September 30, 2016 e-mail response	580
<u>Exhibit W-2:</u>	Governor’s Records Access Officer’s September 30, 2016 acknowledgment	582
<u>Exhibit W-3:</u>	Governor’s Records Access Officer’s October 31, 2016 response.....	583
<u>Exhibit X:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 28, 2016 FOIL request to Attorney General’s Records Access Officer – “RE: Assistant Attorney General Adrienne Kerwin & Guidelines, Policies & Procedures”	590
<u>Exhibit X-1:</u>	Attorney General’s Records Access Officer’s October 5, 2016 acknowledgment	592
<u>Exhibit X-2:</u>	Attorney General’s Records Access Officer’s November 3, 2016 response.....	593
<u>Exhibit X-3:</u>	Plaintiffs’ December 1, 2016 appeal to Attorney General’s FOIL Appeals Officer	599
<u>Exhibit X-4:</u>	Attorney General’s FOIL Appeals Officer’s December 15, 2016 determination	602
<u>Defendants’ March 22, 2017 Opposition to Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 OSC</u>		613
<u>AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Opposing Affirmation</u>		613
<u>Exhibit A:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits).....	87
<u>Exhibit B:</u>	Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	527
<u>Exhibit C:</u>	Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin.....	548
<u>AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Opposing Memorandum of Law</u>		616

<u>Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman</u>	838
With 4 attachments:	
(1) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	647
(2) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	663
(3) Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	655
(4) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	667
<u>Judge Hartman’s March 24, 2107 So-Ordered Letter</u>	840
<u>Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, with Preliminary Injunction & TRO, as signed by Judge Hartman on March 29, 2017</u>	635
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s March 29, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u>	639
<u>Exhibit 1-A:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	647
<u>Exhibit 1-B:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	651
<u>Exhibit 2-A:</u> Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	655
<u>Exhibit 2-B:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	659
<u>Exhibit 3-A:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	663

<u>Exhibit 3-B:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	667
<u>Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Verified Supplemental Complaint</u>	671
<u>Transcript of March 29, 2017 Oral Argument</u>	816
<u>Plaintiffs’ Free-Standing Evidence</u> ¹ , brought to the courthouse on March 29, 2017 to establish their <i>prima facie</i> entitlement to their requested injunctive and declaratory relief – and filed in the Clerk’s Office, with Judge Hartman’s signed Order to Show Cause:	
Defendant Governor Cuomo’s original budget bills	
Defendant Governor Cuomo’s 30-day amended budget bills	
Defendant Senate’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017	
Defendant Assembly’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017	
Defendant Senate’s “one-house budget resolution”	
Defendant Assembly’s “one-house budget resolution”	
<u>Defendants’ April 21, 2017 Opposition to Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 OSC</u>	747
<u>AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Opposing Affirmation</u>	747
<u>Exhibit 1:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits).....	87
<u>Exhibit 2:</u> Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	527
<u>Exhibit 3:</u> Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....	536
<u>Exhibit 4:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on March 29, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....	635
<u>Exhibit 5:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Verified Supplemental Complaint (superseding/corrected).....	671
<u>Exhibit 6:</u> print-out/summary of Assembly Actions on budget bill #A.3000D.....	753

¹ Itemized at ¶8 of plaintiff Sassower’s May 15, 2017 reply affidavit [R-791] and by its Exhibit 7-b [R-863].

<u>Exhibit 7:</u>	page 450 of budget bill #A.3000D.....	754
<u>Exhibit 8:</u>	print-out of budget bill #S.2003D.....	755
<u>Exhibit 9:</u>	“cover page of the Judiciary budget for Fiscal Year 2017-2018, with the certification of the Chief Judge of the Court of Appeals, and approval of the then-current members of the Court of Appeals”.....	761
<u>Exhibit 10:</u>	“cover letter, signed by John J. Flanagan and Carl E. Heastie, certifying the Legislature’s budget for Fiscal Year 2017-2018, submitted to the Governor on December 1, 2016”	765
	<u>AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Opposing Memorandum of Law.....</u>	766
	<u>Judge Hartman’s April 25, 2017 So-Ordered Letter.....</u>	787
	<u>Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman, “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General”.....</u>	810
	<u>Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 So-Ordered Letter</u>	815
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER.....</u>	49
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 AMENDED DECISION AND ORDER.....</u>	52
	<u>Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Reply in Further Support of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause.....</u>	788
	<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s May 15, 2017 Reply Affidavit.....</u>	788
<u>Exhibit 4-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General”.....	810
<u>Exhibit 4-b:</u>	Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 So-Ordered Letter.....	815
<u>Exhibit 5:</u>	Transcript of March 29, 2017 oral argument	816
<u>Exhibit 6-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...& Notice to Attorney General”	838
<u>Exhibit 6-b:</u>	Judge Hartman’s So-Ordered March 24, 2017 Letter.....	840

<u>Exhibit 6-c:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Jeffrey Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	841
<u>Exhibit 6-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “...& notice to Attorney General”	842
<u>Exhibit 6-e:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	843
<u>Exhibit 6-f:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns...”	844
<u>Exhibit 6-g:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	845
<u>Exhibit 6-h:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you”.....	846
<u>Exhibit 6-i:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review”	847
<u>Exhibit 6-j:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail.....	848
<u>Exhibit 6-k:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?”	849
<u>Exhibit 6-l:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail	850
<u>Exhibit 6-m:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AG Meg Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”.....	851
<u>Exhibit 6-n:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman	852
<u>Exhibit 6-o:</u>	Judge Hartman’s March 28, 2017 letter.....	857
<u>Exhibit 6-p:</u>	AG Supervisor Meg Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail: “RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”.....	858
<u>Exhibit 6-q:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to AG Supervisor Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN”.....	859
<u>Exhibit 6-r:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office”.	860

<u>Exhibit 7-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction”.....	861
<u>Exhibit 7-b:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law”	863
<u>Exhibit 7-c:</u>	AAG Lynch’s March 30, 2017 e-mail	865
<u>Exhibit 7-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman”	868
<u>Exhibit 7-e:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED”	870
<u>Exhibit 7-f:</u>	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter	872
<u>Exhibit 7-g:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.”.....	773
<u>Exhibit 7-h:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “...Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’-‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10”	875
<u>Exhibit 8-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	647
<u>Exhibit 8-b:</u>	Senate’s March 31, 2017 response.....	877
<u>Exhibit 8-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 4, 2017 letter to Senate: “Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response...”	878
<u>Exhibit 8-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Senate: “Clarifying the Senate’s response...”	879
<u>Exhibit 8-e:</u>	Senate’s May 5, 2017 response.....	882

<u>Exhibit 9-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	663
<u>Exhibit 9-b:</u>	Senate’s March 31, 2017 response.....	883
<u>Exhibit 9-c:</u>	Senate’s May 4, 2017 letter to Senate: “Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response...”	884
<u>Exhibit 9-d:</u>	Senate’s May 11, 2017 response.....	885
<u>Exhibit 10-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	651
<u>Exhibit 10-b:</u>	Senate’s April 3, 2017 response.....	886
<u>Exhibit 10-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Senate: “Clarifying your April 3, 2017 response...”	887
<u>Exhibit 11-a:</u>	Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	655
<u>Exhibit 11-b:</u>	Assembly’s March 30, 2017 response	888
<u>Exhibit 11-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly: “Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response...”	889
<u>Exhibit 11-d:</u>	Assembly’s May 11, 2017 response	890
<u>Exhibit 12-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	667
<u>Exhibit 12-b:</u>	Assembly’s March 30, 2017 response	891
<u>Exhibit 12-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly: “Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response...”	892
<u>Exhibit 12-d:</u>	Assembly’s May 11, 2017 response	893
<u>Exhibit 13-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	659

<u>Exhibit 13-b</u> : Assembly’s April 3, 2017 acknowledgment.....	659
<u>Exhibit 13-c</u> : Assembly’s April 13, 2017 response	895
<u>Exhibit 13-d</u> : Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly: “Clarifying your April 13, 2017 response...”	896
<u>Exhibit 13-e</u> : Assembly’s May 11, 2017 response	897
<u>Exhibit 14-a</u> : State Operations Budget Bill #S.2000-D/A.3000-D (p. 1).....	898
<u>Exhibit 14-b</u> : Excerpts – State Operations Bill #S.2000/A.3000 (original).....	899
<u>Exhibit 15-a</u> : Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003-D/A.3003-D (p. 1).....	909
<u>Exhibit 15-b</u> : Excerpts – Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003/A.3003 (original).....	910
<u>Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Reply Memorandum of Law</u>	922

**Plaintiffs’ May 19, 2017 letter, enclosing subpoenas *duces tecum* in reply
& in further support of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause**991

Plaintiffs’ Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i> to Senate	992
---	-----

Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	647
---	-----

Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	651
---	-----

Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	663
---	-----

Plaintiffs’ Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i> to Assembly	994
---	-----

Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	655
---	-----

Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	659
---	-----

Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	667
<u>AAG Kerwin’s May 23, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman</u>	996
<u>Plaintiffs’ June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on June 16, 2017</u>	997
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s June 12, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u>	999
<u>Exhibit A-1:</u> AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry.....	1011
<u>Exhibit A-2:</u> Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....	49
<u>Exhibit B-1:</u> AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry.....	1012
<u>Exhibit B-2:</u> Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order	52
<u>Exhibit C:</u> Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement	42
<u>Exhibit D:</u> Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.....	1013
<u>Exhibit E:</u> Plaintiffs’ analysis of AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 opposition to plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause.....	1014
<u>Exhibit F:</u> Plaintiff April 10, 2017 complaint to Third Judicial District Administrative Judge Breslin: “IMMEDIATE SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT REQUIRED: willful, deliberate, and purposeful violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman”.....	1039
<u>Exhibit G:</u> Plaintiffs’ April 21, 2017 complaint to Deputy Chief Administrative Judge Michael Coccoma: “IMMEDIATE SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT REQUIRED – Misconduct Complaint against Third Judicial District Administrative Judge Thomas A. Breslin & his highest-ranking administrative staff, District Executive Beth A. Diebel and Deputy District Executive Christy Q. Bass, for aiding and abetting the willful, deliberate, and purposeful violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman – & by Senior Court Reporter Cindy Affinati”.....	1052

Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service for signed June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause.....	1067
<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’S JUNE 26, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER</u>	68
<u>Defendants’ July 21, 2017 Opposition to Plaintiffs’ June 12, 2017 OSC & Cross-Motion</u>	1069
<u>AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Notice of Cross-Motion</u>	1069
<u>AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition & in Support of Cross-Motion</u>	1071
<u>Exhibit A:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits).....	87
<u>Exhibit B:</u> Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	527
<u>Exhibit C:</u> Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed & verified by AAG Kerwin.....	548
<u>Exhibit D:</u> Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman	536
Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit.....	538
Plaintiffs’ Exhibit U analysis of December 21, 2016 Decision	554
<u>Exhibit E:</u> Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....	49
transmitting May 5, 2017 letter.....	1079
<u>Exhibit F:</u> Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order	52
<u>Exhibit G:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman	635
Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Reply Memorandum of Law.....	922
<u>Exhibit H:</u> Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order.....	68
<u>Exhibit I:</u> Chapter 60, Part E, of the Laws of 2015 – Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation	1080
<u>Exhibit J:</u> December 24, 2015 Report of the Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation	1083

<u>Exhibit K:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in prior citizen-taxpayer action (w/o exhibits).....	226
	Plaintiffs’ Table of Exhibits to March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint and back	1106
<u>Exhibit L:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Order to Show Cause for a Stay with TRO in prior citizen-taxpayer action, as signed by Supreme Court Justice Michael Lynch	1113
<u>Exhibit M:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 letter to Justice Lynch.....	1115
	Justice Lynch’s April 1, 2014 So-Ordered Letter	1118
	Justice Lynch’ March 31, 2014 So-Ordered Letter	1119
<u>Exhibit N:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion	1120
	Plantiffs’ May 16, 2014 Supporting Memorandum of Law	1123
<u>Exhibit O:</u>	Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision and Order	326
<u>Exhibit P:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 Notice of Motion	1161
	Plaintiff Sassower’s_March 31, 2015_Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits)	1163
<u>Exhibit Q:</u>	Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision and Order	335
<u>Exhibit R:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 22, 2015 Notice of Cross-Motion	1171
	Plaintiff Sassower’s September 22, 2015 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits)	1174
<u>Exhibit S:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 23, 2016 Emergency Order to Show Cause with Stay & TRO, as signed by Judge McDonough.....	1182
	Plaintiff Sassower’s March 23, 2016 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits)	1185
<u>Exhibit T:</u>	Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order.....	315
<u>Exhibit U:</u>	Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order	338

<u>Exhibit V:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail.....	1189
	Plaintiffs’ May 8, 2014 e-mail, with transmitted May 8, 2014 letter to Judge McDonough.....	1191
<u>Exhibit W:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1193
	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin, cc: AAG McGowan	1194
	AAG McGowan’s May 2, 2014 e-mail.....	1195
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin	1196
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to Deputy Comptroller Robert Ward, etc, with enclosed May 2, 2014 complaint to the Comptroller’s Investigations Unit.....	1199
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin, with enclosed October 9, 2013 e-mail to scholars....	1201
	Plaintiffs’ May 17, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan, cc to Comptroller’s office	1203
	Plaintiffs’ May 21, 2014 e-mail to AG Intergovernmental Affairs Director Michael Meade, with enclosed May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion.....	1204
	Plaintiffs’ June 6, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan.....	1210
	Plaintiffs’ March 26, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1211
	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1212
	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1213
	Plaintiffs’ March 11, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1214

<u>Exhibit X:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office”.....	860
	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman	852
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction”	861
	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter	872
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman	838
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction”	861
<u>Exhibit Y:</u>	Plaintiffs’ February 24, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1216
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Jeffrey Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	841
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “adjournment request & notice to Attorney General”	842
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	843
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns”	844
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	845
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you”	846
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review”	847
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail.....	848
	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?”	849

AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail	850
Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AG Meg Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”	851
AG Supervisor Meg Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail: “RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”	858
Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to AG Supervisor Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN”	859
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law”	863
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman”	868
Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED”	870
Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.”	873
Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “...Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’ -‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10”	875
<u>Exhibit Z:</u> webpages from CJA’s website: <i>Doris L. Sassower v. Mangano</i> federal action; <i>Elena Sassower v. NYT</i> state action; <i>Elena Sassower</i> <i>v. Commission on Judicial Conduct</i> Article 78 proceeding.....	1218
<u>Exhibit AA:</u> “ <i>Refusal to Apologize Costs Judicial Watchdog 6 Months</i> ” (NYLJ, July 8, 2004, at p. 1), reprinted in Parentadvocates.org.....	1244
<u>Defendants’ July 21, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition and in Support of Cross-Motion</u>	1247

