

TABLE OF CONTENTS – RECORD ON APPEAL

Volume 1: pp. 1 – 535a

Plaintiffs’ Statement Pursuant to CPLR §5531 xxii

Plaintiffs’ January 10, 2018 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement
and accompanying “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge Denise Hartman’s
November 28, 2017 Decision and Judgment1

Judge Hartman’s November 28, 2017 Decision and Judgment.....31

Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement.....42

Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order49

Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order.....52

Plaintiffs’ August 5, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement.....61

Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order.....68

* * *

PLAINTIFFS’ SEPTEMBER 2, 2016 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE,
WITH STAY & TRO, as signed by Judge Roger McDonough80

Plaintiff Sassower’s September 2, 2016 Moving Affidavit.....83

PLAINTIFFS’ SEPTEMBER 2, 2016 SUMMONS & VERIFIED COMPLAINT85

The September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint [at R.99, fn. 1] incorporates by reference the record of plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, *CJA v. Cuomo, et al.* (Albany Co. #1788-2014), and annexes its three verified pleadings as Exhibits A, B, and C, the three decisions of Judge McDonough thereon as Exhibits D, E, and F, and plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy/analysis” of those three decisions as Exhibit G, as follows:

<u>Exhibit A:</u>	March 23, 2016 Verified Second Supplemental Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, <i>CJA v. Cuomo, et al.</i> (Albany Co. #1788-2014)	135
<u>Exhibit B:</u>	March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, <i>CJA v. Cuomo, et al.</i> (Albany Co. #1788-2014)	226
<u>Exhibit C:</u>	March 31, 2015 Verified Supplemental Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action, <i>CJA v. Cuomo, et al.</i> (Albany Co. #1788-2014)	273
<u>Exhibit D:</u>	Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order	315
<u>Exhibit E:</u>	Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision and Order	326
<u>Exhibit F:</u>	Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision and Order	335
<u>Exhibit G:</u>	Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Justice McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order	338
<u>Exhibit H:</u>	Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d; pp. 1-2, 72-73, 94, 96-97, 100, 124-125	374
<u>Exhibit I-1:</u>	Plaintiffs’ July 13, 2016 FOIL request to Comptroller’s records access officer: “State Aid to the Counties for District Attorney Salaries for Calendar Years 2010-2016”	384
<u>Exhibit I-2:</u>	July 20, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer	386
<u>Exhibit I-3:</u>	July 22, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer	387
<u>Exhibit J-1:</u>	Plaintiffs’ July 11, 2016 FOIL request to Criminal Justice Services and Division of the Budget records access officers: ‘The ‘plan’ to reimburse counties not covered by Judiciary Law §183-a for district attorney salaries: fiscal years 2016-17, 2015-16, and 2014-15”	388
<u>Exhibit J-2:</u>	July 15, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services’ records access officer	389
<u>Exhibit J-3:</u>	August 12, 2016 e-mail from Division of Criminal Justice Services’ records access officer	390
<u>Exhibit J-4:</u>	July 25, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer	391

<u>Exhibit K:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 1, 2016 FOIL request: “Director of the Budget’s certificate of approval of the Division of Criminal Justice Services’ budget for fiscal year 2016-2017, contained in Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.6403-d/A.9003-d – & any certification by the Division of Criminal Justice Services of its own budget”	392
	<u>TRANSCRIPT OF SEPTEMBER 2, 2016 ORAL ARGUMENT</u>	392a, 444
	<u>PLAINTIFFS’ SEPTEMBER 7, 2016 NOTICE TO NYS’ 62 COUNTIES & THEIR INSTITUTIONAL/LOBBYING ENTITIES OF THEIR RIGHT TO SEEK INTERVENTION, PURSUANT TO CPLR §1012 and §1013</u>	393
	Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service and transmitting e-mails.....	397
	– to 62 counties & their institutional/lobbying entities.....	398
	– to AAG Kerwin – “I take this opportunity to reiterate plaintiffs’ request that the Attorney General intervene on plaintiffs’ behalf or undertake our representation...Please promptly advise who is <u>independently</u> evaluating our entitlement thereto pursuant to State Finance Law Article 7-A and Executive Law §63.1.	400
	<u>DEFENDANTS’ SEPTEMBER 15, 2016 OPPOSITION/CROSS MOTION</u>	403
	<u>AAG Kerwin’s September 15, 2016 Notice of Cross-Motion</u>	403
	<u>AAG Kerwin’s September 15, 2016 Affirmation</u>	405
	<u>Exhibit A:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Summons & Verified Complaint	410a, 85
	<u>Exhibit B:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Order to Show Cause & Moving Affidavit	410a, 80
	<u>AAG Kerwin’s September 15, 2016 Memorandum of Law in Opposition & in Support of Cross-Motion</u>	411
	Appendix – September 1, 2016 Decision/Supreme Court-Nassau Co – <i>Coll v. NYS Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation</i> (Nassau Co. Supreme Court #2598-2016).....	428

<u>PLAINTIFFS’ SEPTEMBER 30, 2016 REPLY/OPPOSITION</u>	429
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s September 30, 2016 Affidavit in Reply & Opposition</u>	429
<u>Exhibit L:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 23, 2016 FOIL/records request to Governor Cuomo’s records access officer & to the Secretary of the Senate – “Nomination & Confirmation of Denise Hartman to the New York Court of Appeals”	440
<u>Exhibit M-1:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 8, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	440a, 400
<u>Exhibit M-2:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 16, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	441
<u>Exhibit N:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 28, 2016 FOIL request to Attorney General Schneiderman’s records access officer – “Assistant Attorney General Kerwin & Guidelines, Policies & Procedures”	442
<u>Exhibit O:</u> Transcript of September 2, 2016 oral argument	444
<u>Exhibit P:</u> April 5, 2016 complaint in <i>James Coll v. NYS Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation, NYS Legislature, NYS Governor (Supreme Court/Nassau Co.)</i>	459
<u>Exhibit Q-1:</u> September 9, 2016 e-mail from Secretary of the Senate	463
<u>Exhibit Q-2:</u> September 9, 2016 letter from Assembly records access officer	464
<u>Exhibit Q-3:</u> September 9, 2016 letter from Division of the Budget records access officer	465
<u>Exhibit Q-4:</u> September 12, 2016 letter from Comptroller’s records access officer	466
<u>Exhibit R:</u> Plaintiffs’ September 7, 2016 e-mail to NYS’ 62 counties and their institutional/lobbying entities	466a, 398
Plaintiffs’ enclosed September 7, 2016 Notice of Right to Seek Intervention	466a, 393
<u>Exhibit S:</u> September 8, 2016 Affidavit of Service for plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint, Order to Show Cause, & Moving Affidavit	467
<u>Plaintiffs’ September 30, 2016 Memorandum of Law in Reply & in Opposition to Cross-Motion</u>	471

JUDGE HARTMAN’s DECEMBER 21, 2016 DECISION AND ORDER.....527

DEFENDANTS’ JANUARY 20, 2017 ANSWER,
signed and verified by AAG Kerwin.....535a, 548

Volume 2: pp. 536-996

PLAINTIFFS’ FEBRUARY 15, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE,
as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017536

Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit.....538

Exhibit T-1: Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....527

Exhibit T-2: AAG Kerwin’s February 3, 2017 Notice of Entry.....545

Exhibit T-3: Plaintiff Sassower’s January 17, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin546

Exhibit T-4: Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer to plaintiffs’ Verified
Complaint, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin548

Exhibit U: **Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis**
of Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order554

Exhibit V: Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin578

Exhibit W: Plaintiffs’ September 23, 2016 FOIL/records request to Secretary
of Senate & Governor’s records access officer –
“RE: Nomination & Confirmation of Denise Hartman to the New
York Court of Claims”579

Exhibit W-1: September 30, 2016 e-mail response from Secretary of the Senate580

Exhibit W-2: September 30, 2016 acknowledgment from Governor’s records
access officer.....582

Exhibit W-3: October 31, 2016 response from Governor’s records access officer583

<u>Exhibit X:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 28, 2016 FOIL request to Attorney General’s records access officer – “RE: Assistant Attorney General Adrienne Kerwin & Guidelines, Policies & Procedures”	590
<u>Exhibit X-1:</u>	October 5, 2016 acknowledgment from Attorney General’s records access officer.....	592
<u>Exhibit X-2:</u>	November 3, 2016 response from Attorney General’s records access officer.....	593
<u>Exhibit X-3:</u>	Plaintiffs’ December 1, 2016 appeal to Attorney General’s FOIL appeals officer	599
<u>Exhibit X-4:</u>	December 15, 2016 determination of Attorney General’s FOIL appeals officer	602
	Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mails	610
	“As Attorney General Schneiderman bears foremost responsibility for the conduct of his office and for upholding the rule of law and Constitution in this state, please furnish this e-mail to him, as well, with my request that he also call me.”	612
	<u>DEFENDANTS’ MARCH 22, 2017 OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ FEBRUARY 15, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE</u>	613
	<u>AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition</u>	613
<u>Exhibit A:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits)	615a, 87
<u>Exhibit B:</u>	Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	615a, 527
<u>Exhibit C:</u>	Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed and verified by AAG Kerwin	615a, 548
	<u>AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition</u>	616
	<u>PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 24, 2017 LETTER TO JUDGE HARTMAN “...& Notice to the Attorney General”</u>	634a, 838
	With 4 enclosures:	
	(1) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	634a, 647

(2) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	634a, 663
(3) Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	634a, 655
(4) Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	634a, 667
<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MARCH 24, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER</u>	634a, 840
<u>PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 29, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE, WITH PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION & TRO, as signed by Judge Hartman</u>	635
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s March 29, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u>	639
<u>Exhibit 1-A:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	647
<u>Exhibit 1-B:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	651
<u>Exhibit 2-A:</u> Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	655
<u>Exhibit 2-B:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	659
<u>Exhibit 3-A:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	663
<u>Exhibit 3-B:</u> Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	667

PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 29, 2017 VERIFIED SUPPLEMENTAL COMPLAINT.....671

TRANSCRIPT OF MARCH 29, 2017 ORAL ARGUMENT746a, 816

Plaintiffs’ Free-Standing Evidence, which plaintiff Sassower brought to the courthouse on March 29, 2017 to establish plaintiffs’ *prima facie* entitlement to the granting of the second, third, fourth, fifth, and sixth branches of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause [R.636-637] – and then filed in the Clerk’s Office with the signed, original Order to Show Cause [R. 635-638], immediately following the oral argument¹:

1. Defendant Governor Cuomo’s original budget bills
2. Defendant Governor Cuomo’s 30-day amended budget bills
3. Defendant Senate’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017
4. Defendant Assembly’s budget bills which it purported to have “amended” on March 13, 2017 and March 20, 2017
5. Defendant Senate’s “one-house budget resolution”
6. Defendant Assembly’s “one-house budget resolution”

DEFENDANTS’ APRIL 21, 2017 OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ MARCH 29, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE.....747

AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition747

Exhibit 1: Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits)752a, 87

Exhibit 2: Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....752a, 527

Exhibit 3: Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on February 21, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....752a,536

Exhibit 4: Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman on March 29, 2017 (w/o affidavit & exhibits).....752a, 635

Exhibit 5: Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Verified Supplemental Complaint (superseding/corrected).....752a, 671

¹ Recounted by plaintiff Sassower’s March 30, 2017 e-mail, annexed as Exhibit 7-b [R.863] to her May 15, 2017 reply affidavit, in substantiation of its ¶8 [R.791] itemizing this free-standing evidence.

<u>Exhibit 6:</u>	print-out/summary of Assembly Actions on budget bill #A.3000D.....	753
<u>Exhibit 7:</u>	page 450 of budget bill #A.3000D.....	754
<u>Exhibit 8:</u>	print-out of budget bill #S.2003D.....	755
<u>Exhibit 9:</u>	purported “cover page of the Judiciary budget for Fiscal Year 2017-2018, with the certification of the Chief Judge of the Court of Appeals, and approval of the then-current members of the Court of Appeals”	761
<u>Exhibit 10:</u>	purported “cover letter, signed by John J. Flanagan and Carl E. Heastie, certifying the Legislature’s budget for Fiscal Year 2017-2018, submitted to the Governor on December 1, 2016”	765
	<u>AAG Lynch’s April 21, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition</u>	766
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s APRIL 25, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER</u>	787
	<u>PLAINTIFFS’ APRIL 28, 2017 LETTER TO JUDGE HARTMAN, “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General”</u>	787a, 810
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER</u>	787a, 815
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER</u>	49
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s MAY 5, 2017 AMENDED DECISION AND ORDER</u>	52
	<u>Plaintiffs’ MAY 15, 2017 REPLY IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF THEIR MARCH 29, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE</u>	788
	<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s May 15, 2017 Reply Affidavit</u>	788
	Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mail – “Plaintiffs have no objection to your belatedly withdrawing your opposition papers and taking such other remedial steps, as is your duty to do”	808
<u>Exhibit 4-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...Plus Notice to the Attorney General”.....	810
<u>Exhibit 4-b:</u>	Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 So-Ordered Letter.....	815
<u>Exhibit 5:</u>	Transcript of March 29, 2017 oral argument	816

<u>Exhibit 6-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman: “...& Notice to Attorney General”	838
<u>Exhibit 6-b:</u>	Judge Hartman’s So-Ordered March 24, 2017 Letter.....	840
<u>Exhibit 6-c:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Jeffrey Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	841
<u>Exhibit 6-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “...& notice to Attorney General”	842
<u>Exhibit 6-e:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	843
<u>Exhibit 6-f:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns...”	844
<u>Exhibit 6-g:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	845
<u>Exhibit 6-h:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you”	846
<u>Exhibit 6-i:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review”	847
<u>Exhibit 6-j:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail.....	848
<u>Exhibit 6-k:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?”	849
<u>Exhibit 6-l:</u>	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail	850
<u>Exhibit 6-m:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AG Meg Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”	851
<u>Exhibit 6-n:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman	852
<u>Exhibit 6-o:</u>	Judge Hartman’s March 28, 2017 letter.....	857
<u>Exhibit 6-p:</u>	AG Supervisor Meg Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail: “RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”	858
<u>Exhibit 6-q:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to AG Supervisor Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN”	859

<u>Exhibit 6-r:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office”	860
<u>Exhibit 7-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction”	861
<u>Exhibit 7-b:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law”	863
<u>Exhibit 7-c:</u>	AAG Lynch’s March 30, 2017 e-mail	865
<u>Exhibit 7-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman”	868
<u>Exhibit 7-e:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED”	870
<u>Exhibit 7-f:</u>	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter	872
<u>Exhibit 7-g:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.”	773
<u>Exhibit 7-h:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “...Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’-‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10”	875
<u>Exhibit 8-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	876a, 647
<u>Exhibit 8-b:</u>	March 31, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate	877
<u>Exhibit 8-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response...”	878

<u>Exhibit 8-d:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 28, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying the Senate’s response...”	879
<u>Exhibit 8-e:</u>	May 5, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate	882
<u>Exhibit 9-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	882a, 663
<u>Exhibit 9-b:</u>	March 31, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate	883
<u>Exhibit 9-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying your March 31, 2017 response...”	884
<u>Exhibit 9-d:</u>	May 11, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate	885
<u>Exhibit 10-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	885a, 651
<u>Exhibit 10-b:</u>	April 3, 2017 response from Secretary of the Senate	886
<u>Exhibit 10-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Secretary of the Senate: “Clarifying your April 3, 2017 response...”	887
<u>Exhibit 11-a:</u>	Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	887a, 655
<u>Exhibit 11-b:</u>	March 30, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	888
<u>Exhibit 11-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response...”	889
<u>Exhibit 11-d:</u>	May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	890
<u>Exhibit 12-a:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	890a, 667
<u>Exhibit 12-b:</u>	March 30, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer.....	891
<u>Exhibit 12-c:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your March 30, 2017 response...”	892

<u>Exhibit 12-d</u> : May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer	893
<u>Exhibit 13-a</u> : Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	893a, 659
<u>Exhibit 13-b</u> : April 3, 2017 acknowledgment from Assembly records access officer	894
<u>Exhibit 13-c</u> : Assembly’s April 13, 2017 response	895
<u>Exhibit 13-d</u> : Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2017 letter to Assembly records access officer: “Clarifying your April 13, 2017 response...”	896
<u>Exhibit 13-e</u> : May 11, 2017 response from Assembly records access officer	897
<u>Exhibit 14-a</u> : State Operations Budget Bill #S.2000-D/A.3000-D (p. 1)	898
<u>Exhibit 14-b</u> : Excerpts – State Operations Bill #S.2000/A.3000 (original).....	899
<u>Exhibit 15-a</u> : Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003-D/A.3003-D (p. 1).....	909
<u>Exhibit 15-b</u> : Excerpts – Aid to Localities Budget Bill #S.2003/A.3003 (original).....	910
<u>Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Reply and in Further Support of March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause</u>	922
Affidavit of Service, with transmitting e-mail – “Plaintiffs have no objection to your belatedly withdrawing your opposition papers and taking such other remedial steps, as is your duty to do”	989
<u>Plaintiffs’ May 19, 2017 letter, enclosing subpoenas <i>duces tecum</i> in reply & in further support of their March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause</u>	991
Plaintiffs’ Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i> to Secretary of the Senate	992
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	993a, 647
Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #S.2002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	993a, 651

Plaintiff March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Secretary of the Senate: “March 12, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	993a, 663
Plaintiffs’ Subpoena <i>Duces Tecum</i> to Assembly records access officer	994
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 13, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2017-2018”	995a, 655
Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 20, 2017 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s Debt Service Budget Bill #A.3002 for fiscal year 2017-2018”	995a, 659
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 FOIL/records request to Assembly records access officer: “March 11, 2016 ‘amending’ of Governor Cuomo’s budget bills for fiscal year 2016-2017”	995a, 667
<u>AAG Kerwin’s May 23, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman</u>	996

Volume 3: pp. 997 - 1386

<u>PLAINTIFFS’ JUNE 12, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE, as signed by Judge Hartman on June 16, 2017</u>	997
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s June 12, 2017 Moving Affidavit</u>	999
(plaintiffs’ analysis of Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 decision at ¶¶5-8, 10-11 [R.1002-1007])	
<u>Exhibit A-1</u> : AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry.....	1011
<u>Exhibit A-2</u> : Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....	1011a, 49
<u>Exhibit B-1</u> : AAG Kerwin’s May 11, 2017 Notice of Entry.....	1012
<u>Exhibit B-2</u> : Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order	1012a, 52
<u>Exhibit C</u> : Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 Notice of Appeal, with Pre-Calendar Statement	1012b, 42
<u>Exhibit D</u> : Plaintiffs’ June 10, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.....	1013

<u>Exhibit E:</u>	Plaintiffs’ analysis of AAG Kerwin’s March 22, 2017 opposition to plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause	1014
<u>Exhibit F:</u>	Plaintiff’ April 10, 2017 complaint to Third Judicial District Administrative Judge Breslin: “IMMEDIATE SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT REQUIRED: willful, deliberate, and purposeful violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman”.....	1039
<u>Exhibit G:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 21, 2017 complaint to Deputy Chief Administrative Judge Michael Coccoma: “IMMEDIATE SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT REQUIRED – Misconduct Complaint against Third Judicial District Administrative Judge Thomas A. Breslin & his highest-ranking administrative staff, District Executive Beth A. Diebel and Deputy District Executive Christy Q. Bass, for aiding and abetting the willful, deliberate, and purposeful violation of State Finance Law §123-c(4) by Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman – & by Senior Court Reporter Cindy Affinati”	1052
	Plaintiffs’ Affidavit of Service for signed June 12, 2017 Order to Show Cause, with transmitting e-mail “...NOTICE TO SUPERVISORY/MANAGERIAL LEVELS, INCLUDING DEFENDANT AG SCHNEIDERMAN”	1067
	<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’S JUNE 26, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER</u>	68
	<u>DEFENDANTS’ JULY 21, 2017 OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ JUNE 21, 2017 OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS’ JUNE 12, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE AND CROSS-MOTION</u>	1069
	<u>AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Notice of Cross-Motion</u>	1069
	<u>AAG Kerwin’s July 21, 2017 Affirmation in Opposition & in Support of Cross-Motion</u>	1071
<u>Exhibit A:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2016 Verified Complaint (w/o exhibits)	1078a, 87
<u>Exhibit B:</u>	Judge Hartman’s December 21, 2016 Decision and Order.....	1078a, 527
<u>Exhibit C:</u>	Defendants’ January 20, 2017 Answer, signed & verified by AAG Kerwin.....	1078a, 548

<u>Exhibit D:</u>	Plaintiffs’ February 15, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman	1078a, 536
	Plaintiff Sassower’s February 15, 2017 Moving Affidavit.....	1078a, 538
	Plaintiffs’ Exhibit U analysis of December 21, 2016 Decision ...	1078a, 554
<u>Exhibit E:</u>	Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Decision and Order.....	1078a, 49
	transmitting May 5, 2017 letter.....	1078a, 1079
<u>Exhibit F:</u>	Judge Hartman’s May 5, 2017 Amended Decision and Order	1078a, 52
<u>Exhibit G:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 29, 2017 Order to Show Cause, as signed by Judge Hartman	1078a, 635
	Plaintiffs’ May 15, 2017 Reply Memorandum of Law.....	1078a, 922
<u>Exhibit H:</u>	Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order.....	1078a, 68
<u>Exhibit I:</u>	Chapter 60, Part E, of the Laws of 2015 – Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation	1080
<u>Exhibit J:</u>	December 24, 2015 Report of the Commission on Legislative, Judicial and Executive Compensation	1083
<u>Exhibit K:</u>	March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint in plaintiffs’ prior citizen-taxpayer action (w/o exhibits).....	1105a, 226
	Table of Exhibits to plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Verified Complaint and back.....	1105a, 1106
<u>Exhibit L:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2014 Order to Show Cause for a Stay with TRO in prior citizen-taxpayer action, as signed by Supreme Court Justice Michael Lynch	1113
<u>Exhibit M:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 letter to Justice Lynch.....	1115
	Justice Lynch’s April 1, 2014 So-Ordered Letter	1118
	Justice Lynch’ March 31, 2014 So-Ordered Letter	1119
<u>Exhibit N:</u>	Plaintiffs’ May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion	1120
	Plaintiffs’ May 16, 2014 Supporting Memorandum of Law	1123
<u>Exhibit O:</u>	Judge McDonough’s October 9, 2014 Decision and Order	1160a, 326

<u>Exhibit P:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 Notice of Motion	1161
	Plaintiff Sassower’s_March 31, 2015_Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits)	1163
<u>Exhibit Q:</u>	Judge McDonough’s June 24, 2015 Decision and Order	1170a, 335
<u>Exhibit R:</u>	Plaintiffs’ September 22, 2015 Notice of Cross-Motion	1171
	Plaintiff Sassower’s September 22, 2015 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits)	1174
<u>Exhibit S:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 23, 2016 Emergency Order to Show Cause with Stay & TRO, as signed by Judge McDonough.....	1182
	Plaintiff Sassower’s March 23, 2016 Moving Affidavit (w/o exhibits)	1185
<u>Exhibit T:</u>	Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order	1188a, 315
<u>Exhibit U:</u>	Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge McDonough’s August 1, 2016 Amended Decision and Order	1188a, 338
<u>Exhibit V:</u>	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail	1189
	Plaintiffs’ May 8, 2014 e-mail, with transmitted May 8, 2014 letter to Judge McDonough.....	1191
<u>Exhibit W:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1193
	Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG Kerwin, cc: AAG McGowen	1194
	AAG McGowan’s May 2, 2014 e-mail.....	1195
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin	1196
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to Deputy Comptroller Robert Ward, etc., with enclosed May 2, 2014 complaint to Comptroller DiNapoli’s Investigations Unit.....	1199
	Plaintiffs’ May 2, 2014 e-mail to AAG McGowan, cc: AAG Kerwin, with enclosed October 9, 2013 e-mail to scholars....	1201

	Plaintiffs’ May 17, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan, cc to Comptroller’s office	1203
	Plaintiffs’ May 21, 2014 e-mail to Attorney General Schneiderman’s Intergovernmental Affairs Bureau Director, with enclosed May 16, 2014 Notice of Cross-Motion	1204
	Plaintiffs’ June 6, 2014 e-mail to AAGs Kerwin, McGowan.....	1210
	Plaintiffs’ March 26, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1211
	Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1212
	Plaintiffs’ September 2, 2015 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1213
	Plaintiffs’ March 11, 2016 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1214
<u>Exhibit X:</u>	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “further notice to the highest supervisory levels of the Attorney General’s office”	1215a, 860
	Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman	1215a, 852
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction”	1215a, 861
	Judge Hartman’s March 31, 2017 letter	1215a, 872
	Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman	1215a, 838
	Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Judge Hartman: “URGENT/TIME-SENSITIVE: Reconsideration – & the granting of a TRO and/or the scheduling of an evidentiary hearing, tomorrow, on plaintiffs’ entitlement to a preliminary injunction”	1215a, 861
<u>Exhibit Y:</u>	Plaintiffs’ February 24, 2017 e-mail to AAG Kerwin	1216
	AG Litigation Bureau Chief Jeffrey Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail.....	1217a, 841

Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “adjournment request & notice to Attorney General”	1217a, 842
AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail....	1217a, 843
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Concerns”	1217a, 844
AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 24, 2017 e-mail....	1217a, 845
Plaintiffs’ March 24, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Thank you”	1217a, 846
Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “Awaiting the results of your review”	1217a, 847
AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail....	1217a, 848
Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Bureau Chief Dvorin: “handled appropriately in all respects by this office?”	1217a, 849
AG Litigation Bureau Chief Dvorin’s March 27, 2017 e-mail ...	1217a, 850
Plaintiffs’ March 27, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Meg Levine: “YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”	1217a, 851
AAG Supervisor Meg Levine’s March 28, 2017 e-mail: “RE: YOUR SUPERVISORY OVERSIGHT IS URGENTLY REQUIRED”	1217a, 858
Plaintiffs’ March 28, 2017 e-mail to AAG Supervisor Levine: “GOING UP THE SUPERVISORY LADDER – INCLUDING TO AG SCHNEIDERMAN”	1217a, 859
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to Supervising AAG Levine, etc.: “Request that the AG rise above his conflict of interest & do his duty to secure the TRO to which plaintiffs were entitled yesterday, as a matter of law”	1217a, 863
Plaintiffs’ March 30, 2017 e-mail to AAG Lynch: “Your letter of retraction to Justice Hartman”	1217a, 868
Plaintiffs’ March 31, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman, etc.: “IMMEDIATE OVERSIGHT & ACTION REQUIRED”	1217a, 870

Plaintiffs’ April 2, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “NYS BUDGET & the AG’s DUTY TO IMMEDIATELY SECURE A TRO, etc.”	1217a, 873
Plaintiffs’ April 5, 2017 e-mail to AG Schneiderman: “... Your duty to advise your co-defendant clients of their treason to the NYS Constitution by their behind-closed-doors, ‘3-men-in- a-room’-‘amended’ budget bills – violating Article VII, §§4, 5, 6 and Article III, §10”	1217a, 875
<u>Exhibit Z:</u> webpages from CJA’s website, www.judgewatch.org : <i>Doris L. Sassower v. Mangano</i> federal action	1218
<i>Elena Sassower v. New York Times</i> state action	1227
<i>Elena Sassower v. Commission on Judicial Conduct</i> Article 78 proceeding.....	1236
<u>Exhibit AA:</u> “ <i>Refusal to Apologize Costs Judicial Watchdog 6 Months</i> ” (<u>New York Law Journal</u> , July 8, 2004, at p. 1).....	1244
reprinted as “ <i>Whistleblower of Judicial Misconduct is Put in Jail For 6 Months: They REALLY do not like criticism of any kind</i> ” (ParentAdvocates.org)	1245
<u>Defendants’ July 21, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Opposition and in Support of Cross-Motion</u>	1247
<u>PLAINTIFFS’ JULY 27, 2017 LETTER TO JUDGE HARTMAN, “...& NOTICE TO THE ATTORNEY GENERAL”</u>	1282
<u>JUDGE HARTMAN’s AUGUST 7, 2017 SO-ORDERED LETTER</u>	1292
<u>PLAINTIFFS’ AUGUST 25, 2017 REPLY IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF THEIR JUNE 12, 2017 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE AND IN OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS’ JULY 21, 2017 CROSS-MOTION</u>	1274
<u>Plaintiff Sassower’s August 25, 2017 Affidavit in Reply and in Opposition</u>	1274
<u>Exhibit H-1:</u> Plaintiffs’ July 27, 2017 letter to Judge Hartman, “...& NOTICE TO THE ATTORNEY GENERAL”	1282
<u>Exhibit H-2:</u> Judge Hartman’s August 7, 2017 So-Ordered Letter	1292
<u>Exhibit I:</u> Plaintiffs’ “legal autopsy”/analysis of Judge Hartman’s June 26, 2017 Decision and Order.....	1293

Exhibit J: Plaintiffs’ June 16, 2017 complaint to Commission on Judicial Conduct: “Conflict-of-interest/corruption complaint against Acting Supreme Court Justice/Court of Claims Judge Denise A. Hartman for willfully violating judicial disclosure/disqualification rules in order to ‘throw’ a citizen-taxpayer action in which she is financially interested & has personal and professional relationships with defendants”1320

Plaintiffs’ August 25, 2017 Memorandum of Law in Reply & in Opposition to Cross-Motion1328

Affidavits of Service for Plaintiffs’ Reply Affidavit & Memorandum of Law, with transmitting e-mails –
 “I hereby reiterate the NOTICE that I gave you on July 27, 2017, to WITHDRAW AAG KERWIN’s OPPOSITION/CROSS-MOTION – which is your duty to do, as likewise, to join in plaintiffs’ application, by their August 25th reply papers, for Judge Hartman’s disqualification and vacatur of her decision/orders – all fraudulent”1383

Plaintiffs’ Stipulation in Lieu of Certification Pursuant to CPLR §5532