

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK  
APPELLATE DIVISION, SECOND DEPARTMENT

----- X

ELENA RUTH SASSOWER and DORIS L. SASSOWER,  
Individually and as Director and President, respectively,  
of the Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc., and  
CENTER FOR JUDICIAL ACCOUNTABILITY, INC.,  
Acting *Pro Bono Publico*,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

App. Div. #: 2012-00126

App. Div. #: 2012-05360

Suffolk Co. # 10-12596

-against-

GANNETT COMPANY, INC., The Journal News, LoHud.com  
HENRY FREEMAN, CYNDEE ROYLE, BOB FREDERICKS,  
D. SCOTT FAUBEL, KEITH EDDINGS, DOES 1-10,

Defendants-Respondents.

---

APPELLANTS' RECORD ON APPEAL

---

ELENA RUTH SASSOWER, *Pro Se*  
Individually & Acting *Pro Bono Publico*  
10 Stewart Place, Apt. 2DE  
White Plains, New York 10603  
Tel: 646-220-7987

Attorneys for DORIS L. SASSOWER, Individually and as  
President of the Center for Judicial Accountability, Inc.,  
ELENA RUTH SASSOWER, as Director of the Center for  
Judicial Accountability, Inc, and CENTER FOR JUDICIAL  
ACCOUNTABILITY, INC., Acting *Pro Bono Publico*

SATTERLEE, STEPHENS, BURKE & BURKE LLP  
Attorneys for all Defendants except  
Defendant Keith Eddings & Defendant DOES 1-10  
230 Park Avenue  
New York, New York 10169  
Tel: 212-818-9200

RECEIVED  
12 AUG 20 PM 12:12  
APPELLATE DIVISION  
SECOND DEPARTMENT

**RECORD ON APPEAL**

Plaintiffs’ December 20, 2011 Notice of Appeal..... 1

**Justice Peter Fox Cohalan’s September 22, 2011 Short-Form Order** ..... 3

Plaintiffs’ May 18, 2012 Notice of Appeal..... 9

**Justice Peter Fox Cohalan’s April 23, 2012 Short-Form Order**..... 11

\* \* \*

Plaintiffs’ May 4, 2010 Summons with Notice ..... 12

Satterlee’s September 8, 2010 Notice of Appearance and Demand for Complaint..... 14

**Plaintiffs’ October 4, 2010 Verified Complaint** ..... 16

Exhibit 1a: Elena Sassower’s published article “*Without Merit: The Empty Promise of Judicial Discipline*”, The Long Term View (Massachusetts School of Law), Vol. 4, No. 1: Summer 1997..... 54

Exhibit 1b: “*True Believers*”, Westchester County Weekly, March 19, 1998 ..... 64

Exhibit 1c: “*Delfino – Nicoletti – Sassower – Persons of the Year*”, White Plains CitizeNetReporter, January 3, 2005 ..... 65

Exhibit 1d: Doris Sassower’s Martindale-Hubbell Law Directory Listing, 1989 ..... 70

Exhibit 1e: Doris Sassower’s front-page article “*Judicial Selection Panels: An Exercise in Futility?*”, New York Law Journal, October 22, 1971..... 71

Exhibit 1f: Giraffe Project Press Release – “A Giraffe’s been sighted in your territory!”, with October 21, 1997 Commendation to Doris Sassower ..... 72

Exhibit 2a: Elena Sassower’s April 4, 1992 fax to Gannett Suburban Newspapers – “RE: Your Libelous and Malicious story appearing in today’s newspaper – Saturday, April 4, 1992” ..... 74

Exhibit 2b: Doris Sassower’s April 4, 1992 fax to Gannett Suburban Newspapers – “RE: Your latest libelous and malicious story appearing today, Saturday, April 4, 1992” ..... 75

<u>Exhibit 3a:</u>	October 26, 1992 Summons with Notice: <i>Doris L. Sassower v. Gannett</i> .....	76
<u>Exhibit 3b:</u>	Elena Sassower’s December 5, 1995 letter to Richard Liebson, Columnist/Gannett Suburban Newspapers – “RE: Gannett’s follow-up to Sea Star” .....	78
<u>Exhibit 3c:</u>	Elena Sassower’s December 6, 1995 letter to Nancy Blair, Local Editor/Gannett Suburban Newspapers .....	80
<u>Exhibit 3d:</u>	December 21, 1995 letter from Gannett Suburban Newspaper attorneys Satterlee, Stephens, Burke & Burke, LLP – “Re: Sassower v. Gannett”, signed by Mark Fowler.....	82
<u>Exhibit 4a:</u>	“ <b>ACCURACY</b> ”, <u>The Journal News</u> masthead, May 6, 2009 issue, page 2 .....	84
<u>Exhibit 4b:</u>	“Corrections”, <a href="http://www.LoHud.com">www.LoHud.com</a> , accessible via “Contacts-Reader Services” .....	85
<u>Exhibit 5:</u>	“ <i>Comments for White Plains woman heckles city judge during confirmation</i> ”, LoHud.com, May 10, 2009.....	89
<u>Exhibit 6:</u>	CJA’s July 14, 2009 letter to <u>Journal News</u> Senior Managing Editor CynDee Royle – “RE: (1) Retraction of <u>The Journal News</u> ’ knowingly false and defamatory May 6, 2009 article ‘ <i>Hecklers try to derail new city judge</i> ’/‘ <i>White Plains woman heckles city judge during confirmation</i> ’; (2) Journalistic expose of the issue of legitimate public concern the article purposefully concealed, to wit, the corruption of the judicial appointment process by which White Plains gets its City Court Judges, as established by primary-source documentary evidence” .....	91
<u>Exhibit 7:</u>	<b>CJA’s ANALYSIS of “<i>Hecklers try to derail new city judge</i>”/ “<i>White Plains woman heckles city judge during confirmation</i>”, with exhibits</b> .....	93
<u>Analysis-Exhibit A-1:</u>	“ <i>Hecklers try to derail new city judge</i> ”, by Keith Eddings, <u>Journal News</u> , May 6, 2009, p. 3 .....	108
<u>Analysis-Exhibit A-2:</u>	“ <i>White Plains woman heckles city judge during confirmation</i> ”, by Keith Eddings/LoHud.com, May 6, 2009 .....	109

<u>Analysis-Exhibit A-3:</u>	LoHud.com’s sale of “ <i>White Plains woman heckles city judge during confirmation</i> ” .....	110
<u>Analysis-Exhibit B:</u>	CJA’s March 20, 2009 letter to White Plains Corporation Counsel – “RE: The Appointment Process by which White Plains Gets its City Court Judges” .....	111
<u>Analysis-Exhibit C:</u>	CJA’s March 23, 2009 letter to White Plains Mayor – “RE: The Appointment Process by which White Plains Gets its City Court Judges” .....	117
<u>Analysis-Exhibit D:</u>	CJA’s April 30, 2009 memo to White Plains Mayor & Common Council Members – “RE: The Appointment Process by which White Plains Gets its City Court Judges” .....	124
	– with CJA’s April 29, 2009 letter to Corporation Counsel – “RE: The Appointment Process by which White Plains Gets its City Court Judges & FOIL Appeal” .....	125
<u>Analysis-Exhibit E:</u>	CJA’s May 4, 2009 letter to White Plains Mayor – “RE: The Appointment Process by which White Plains Gets its City Court Judges” .....	135
<u>Analysis-Exhibit F:</u>	CJA’s May 4, 2009 e-mail to White Plains Mayor, Common Council Members, & City Clerk – “RE: Reject Mayor Delfino’s Reappointment of Hansbury or at least let it be only until a qualified successor can be named” .....	141
<u>Analysis-Exhibit G-1:</u>	CJA’s May 5, 2009 e-mail to Bob Fredericks, with copy to Keith Eddings – “Subject: How White Plains Gets Its City Court Judges” .....	142
<u>Analysis-Exhibit G-2:</u>	CJA’s May 5, 2009 e-mail to Bob Fredericks, with copy to Keith Eddings – “Subject: Please forward me – <a href="mailto:elena@judgewatch.org">elena@judgewatch.org</a> .....	143
<u>Analysis-Exhibit G-3:</u>	CJA’s May 5, 2009 e-mail to Bob Fredericks, with copy to Keith Eddings – “Subject: Addendum: How White Plains Gets Its City Court Judges” .....	144

<u>Analysis-Exhibit H-1:</u>	“ <i>More light on ‘sunshine’</i> ”; “ <i>State, federal efforts</i> ”; “ <i>Additional Facts</i> ”, <u>Journal News/LoHud.com</u> , March 22, 2009 .....	146
<u>Analysis-Exhibit H-2:</u>	“ <i>In Your Voice</i> ” – Center for Judicial Accountability, March 22, 2009 .....	148
<u>Analysis-Exhibit H-3:</u>	CJA’s March 22, 2009 letter to editor/ proposal for coverage to <u>Journal News</u> – “ <i>Subject: We Applaud your editorial supporting state and federal efforts to open up government...</i> ” .....	151
<u>Analysis-Exhibit I-1:</u>	“ <i>Council’s actions questioned</i> ”, by Keith Eddings/ <u>Journal News</u> , May 14, 2009 .....	152
<u>Analysis-Exhibit I-2:</u>	“ <i>State: White Plains Common Council’s executive session on the budget was illegal</i> ”, by Keith Eddings/ <u>LoHud.com</u> , May 14, 2009 .....	153
<u>Analysis-Exhibit I-3:</u>	“ <i>Wrong Advice</i> ”, editorial/ <u>Journal News</u> , May 15, 2009 .....	154
<u>Analysis-Exhibit I-4:</u>	“ <i>Wrong Advice</i> ”, editorial/ <u>LoHud.com</u> , May 15, 2009 .....	155
<u>Analysis-Exhibit J:</u>	“ <i>Party chief contacts White Plains Dems over school race</i> ”, by Keith Eddings/ <u>Journal News</u> , May 14, 2009 .....	157
<u>Analysis Exhibit K:</u>	“ <i>Awards and Contest Winners</i> ”/ <u>LoHud.com</u> , July 14, 2009 .....	158
<u>Exhibit 8:</u>	CJA’s August 18, 2009 letter to <u>Journal News</u> Senior Managing Editor CynDee Royle, with copies to Faubel, Fredericks, and Eddings – “RE: CJA’s July 14, 2009 letter to you: 1. Retraction of <u>The Journal News</u> ’ knowingly false and defamatory May 6, 2009 article ‘ <i>Hecklers try to derail new city judge</i> ’/‘ <i>White Plains woman heckles city judge during confirmation</i> ’; 2. Journalistic expose of the issue of legitimate public concern the article purposefully concealed, <i>to wit</i> , the corruption of the judicial appointment process by which White Plains gets its City Court Judges, as established by primary-source documentary evidence” .....	160

<u>Exhibit 9:</u>	CJA’s October 27, 2009 e-mail to <u>Journal News</u> Senior Managing Editor CynDee Royle, with copies to Freeman, Faubel, Fredericks, and Eddings – “Subject: Elections: Common Council & Mayor – Retraction/Journalistic Expose, Etc.” .....	162
<b><u>Satterlee’s October 22, 2010 Notice of Motion to Dismiss Complaint</u></b> .....		163
<b>October 22, 2010 Affidavit of Satterlee Attorney Meghan H. Sullivan, Esq.</b> .....		165
Exhibit A:	June 28, 2004 transcript – <i>USA v. Elena Sassower</i> .....	167
Exhibit B:	Judge Gerald Loehr’s July 5, 2006 decision in <i>Sassower v. New York Times Co.</i> .....	192
	Judge Gerald Loehr’s September 27, 2006 decision in <i>Sassower v. New York Times Co.</i> .....	203
<b>October 22, 2010 Affidavit of Satterlee contract attorney Emily S. Smith, Esq.</b> .....		207
Exhibit A:	“true and correct copy of Verified Complaint” .....	209
<b>Satterlee’s October 22, 2010 Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion to Dismiss Complaint</b> .....		211
<b><u>Plaintiffs’ November 29, 2010 Notice of Cross-Motion</u></b> .....		241
<b>Plaintiff Elena Sassower’s November 29, 2010 Affidavit in Opposition &amp; in Support of Cross-Motion</b> .....		244
<u>Exhibit 10:</u>	<b>White Plains Cable Television Access Commission video of the May 4, 2009 White Plains Common Council meeting</b> .....	258
<u>Exhibit 11a:</u>	stenographic transcript of U.S. Senate Judiciary Committee’s May 22, 2003 hearing to confirm the nomination of Richard Wesley to the Second Circuit Court of Appeals, as faxed to Elena Sassower on May 29, 2003 .....	259
<u>Exhibit 11b:</u>	Elena Sassower’s July 7, 2003 analysis of the video and transcript .....	264
<u>Exhibit 12:</u>	April 23, 2007 appellants’ brief in <i>Sassower v. New York Times Co.</i> .....	268
<u>Exhibit 13:</u>	Elena Sassower’s December 14, 2007 written oral argument to the Appellate Division, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Dept. in <i>Sassower v. New York Times Co.</i> .....	341

<u>Exhibit 14:</u>	Appellate Division, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Dept.’s February 5, 2008 decision in <i>Sassower v. New York Times Co.</i> , 48 A.D.3d 440, 852 N.Y.S. 180 .....	346
<u>Exhibit 15a:</u>	Affidavits of Service for Summons with Notice: August 31, 2010 .....	348
<u>Exhibit 15b:</u>	Affidavit of Service for Verified Complaint: October 4-6, 2010 .....	353
<b><u>Exhibit 16:</u></b>	<b>“<i>Journalistic Malpractice: Suing Jayson Blair and the New York Times for Fraud and Negligence</i>”, by Professors Clay Calvert &amp; Robert D. Richards, 11 <u>Fordham Intellectual Property, Media &amp; Entertainment Law Journal</u> 1 (2003).....</b>	<b>371</b>
<b><u>Exhibit 17:</u></b>	<b>“<i>Institutional Reckless Disregard for Truth in Public Defamation Actions Against the Press</i>”, by Professors Randall P. Bezanson &amp; Gilbert Cranberg, 90 <u>Iowa Law Review</u> 887 (2005) .....</b>	<b>399</b>
<u>Exhibit 18:</u>	Satterlee website print-out:	
	(a) Our Approach .....	442
	(b) Practice Area in Media Law.....	444
	(c) credentials of Mark A. Fowler, Esq.....	449
	(d) credentials of Meghan H. Sullivan, Esq.....	450
	<b>Plaintiffs’ November 29, 2010 Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Defendants’ Dismissal Motion &amp; in Support of Plaintiffs’ Cross-Motion .....</b>	<b>451</b>
 <b><u>Satterlee’s Reply Papers</u></b>		
	<b>December 8, 2010 Affidavit of Satterlee attorney Meghan H. Sullivan, Esq. ....</b>	<b>515</b>
	Exhibit A: Ms. Sullivan’s December 5, 2010 e-mail – “Subject: Opposition Papers” .....	517
	<b>December 7, 2010 Affidavit of Minnie Stanley, Director of Employee Relations, <u>Journal News</u> .....</b>	<b>518</b>
	<b>Satterlee’s December 8, 2010 Reply Memorandum of Law in Further Support of Motion to Dismiss Complaint .....</b>	<b>520</b>

**Plaintiffs’ Reply Papers**

**Plaintiff Elena Sassower’s December 15, 2010 Reply Affidavit in Support of Cross-Motion** ..... 539

Exhibit 19: Plaintiff Elena Sassower’s December 6, 2010 e-mail – “Subject: Plaintiffs’ opposition/cross-motion” ..... 541

**Plaintiffs’ December 15, 2010 Reply Memorandum of Law in Further Support of their Cross-Motion** ..... 542

**Plaintiffs’ December 21, 2011 Notice of Motion in Support of Disqualification/Disclosure, Vacatur, Reargument/Renewal & Other Relief**..... 586

**Plaintiff Elena Sassower’s December 21, 2011 Moving Affidavit** ..... 589

Exhibit 20: September 22, 2011 Short-Form Order..... 601

Exhibit 21a: Satterlee’s November 7, 2011 “Notice of Entry” ..... 602

21b: Elena Sassower’s December 2, 2011 e-mail to Satterlee..... 604

21c: Satterlee’s December 2, 2011 e-mail ..... 605

21d: Elena Sassower’s December 5, 2011 e-mail to Satterlee..... 606

21e: Satterlee’s December 12, 2011 e-mail ..... 607

21f: Elena Sassower’s December 12, 2011 e-mail ..... 608

Exhibit 22: Transcript of June 1, 2011 oral argument ..... 609

**Exhibit 23: Plaintiffs’ ANALYSIS of Justice Cohalan’s September 22, 2011 Short-Form Order** ..... 639

Exhibit 24a: Plaintiff CJA’s June 14, 2011 letter to Appellate Division, 2<sup>nd</sup> Dept. Presiding Justice Gail Prudenti – RE: Revocation of Appellate Term Designations of Supreme Court Justices Denise F. Molia & Angela G. Iannacci Based on their Corruption in Office & Other Essential Supervisory Oversight..... 669

Exhibit 24b: Plaintiff CJA’s June 14, 2011 letter to Chief Administrative Judge Ann Pfau – “RE: Revocation of Your Appellate Term Designations of Supreme Court Justices Denise F. Molia & Angela G. Iannacci Based on their Corruption in Office” ..... 670

Attachments:

(1) December 7, 2007 and September 23, 2008 Administrative Orders..... 677

(2) “Introduction” and “Questions Presented”



	from plaintiff Elena Sassower’s three appeal briefs .....	679
	Appeal #1: <i>McFadden v. Elena Sassower</i> .....	679
	Appeal #2: <i>McFadden v. Elena Sassower</i> .....	683
	Appeal #3: <i>McFadden v. Doris Sassower &amp; Elena Sassower</i> .....	688
	(3) March 16, 2011 letter to Appellate Division Panel	
	Justices: (Peter) Skelos, Eng, Hall, Lott –	
	“RE Verifying Your knowledge of, & assent to, the	
	November 26, 2010 Decision & Order bearing your	
	names, but not your signatures, for the October 4, 2010	
	motion in <i>McFadden v. Elena Sassower</i> , #2010-09890 .....	697
	(4) May 23, 2011 letter to Governor Andrew Cuomo,	
	Senate Majority Leader Dean Skelos, Assembly Speaker	
	Sheldon Silver, and Chief Judge Jonathan Lippman –	
	“RE: (1) NYS’s Commission on Judicial Compensation	
	– Inoperative & Inaccessible to the Public;	
	(2) Evidence Disentitling NYS’s Judiciary to	
	Increased Compensation...” .....	704
<u>Exhibit 25a:</u>	Plaintiff CJA’s transmitting August 23, 2011 e-mail to Chief	
	Administrative Judge Pfau, etc. – “Subject: Ensuring that the	
	Commission on Judicial Compensation is Not Led into	
	Constitutional Error: Clarification of the OCA Memorandum...	
	and the Substantiating Evidence” .....	708
<u>Exhibit 5b:</u>	Plaintiff CJA’s August 23, 2011 letter to Chief Administrative	
	Judge Pfau – “RE: Ensuring that the Commission on Judicial	
	Compensation is Not Led into Constitutional Error: Clarification	
	of the Office of Court Administration’s ‘Memorandum discussing	
	constitutional considerations in establishing judicial pay levels’ –	
	and the Substantiating Evidence” .....	709
<u>Exhibit 26:</u>	Executive Summary to Plaintiff CJA’s October 27, 2011 Opposition	
	Report to Governor Cuomo, Senate Majority Leader (Dean) Skelos,	
	Assembly Speaker Silver, and Chief Judge Lippman.....	720
<u>Exhibit 27:</u>	Plaintiff Elena Sassower’s January 5, 2011 letter to Justice Cohalan	
	– “RE: Plaintiffs’ Opposition/Cross-Motion & Reply: Rule 5.1 of	
	New York Rules of Professional Conduct: ‘Responsibilities of Law	
	Firms, Managers and Supervisory Partners” .....	724
<u>Exhibit 28:</u>	Plaintiff Elena Sassower’s May 3, 2011 letter to Justice Cohalan	
	“RE: May 4, 2011 Oral Argument: motion & cross-motion .....	744
<u>Exhibit 29:</u>	Plaintiff’s proposed Fourth Cause of Action for Institutional	
	Reckless Disregard for Truth, with “WHEREFORE” clause.....	747

**Plaintiffs’ December 21, 2011 Memorandum of Law in Support of Disqualification/Disclosure, Vacatur, Reargument/Renewal & Other Relief..... 751**

---

Satterlee’s December 27, 2011 recording of Judgment in the Suffolk County Clerk’s Office, with bill of costs and affirmation of Satterlee attorney Mark A. Fowler, Esq. .... 759

---

**Satterlee’s Opposition Papers**

**January 11, 2012 Opposition Affidavit of Satterlee attorney Michael H. Gibson, Esq. .... 765**

Exhibit 1: Judge Gerald Loehr’s July 5, 2006 decision in *Sassower v. New York Times Co.* ..... 192

Judge Gerald Loehr’s September 27, 2006 decision in *Sassower v. New York Times Co.*..... 203

Exhibit 2: Judge William Wetzel’s January 31, 2000 decision in *Sassower v. Commission on Judicial Conduct of the State of NY* ..... 768

Exhibit 3: *Mancusi v. New York Post*, 6 Media L. Rep. 1784 (Sup Ct. Queens Co. 1980) ..... 774

Exhibit 4: *Wilkins v. New York Post*, 32 Media L. Rep. 1566 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. 2003) ..... 775

**Satterlee’s January 11, 2012 Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Plaintiffs’ Motion for Leave to Reargue/Renewal, to Disqualify, & for Sanctions..... 780**

---

Satterlee’s January 24, 2012 Notice of Entry for Judgment entered on December 27, 2011 ..... 808

---

**Plaintiffs’ Reply Papers**

**Elena Sassower’s February 10, 2012 Affidavit in Reply & in Further Support of Plaintiffs’ Motion for Disqualification/Disclosure, Vacatur, Reargument & Other Relief ..... 810**